Chapter 10

Russian Federation

Iliya Zotkin, Clémence Bastien and Grégory Mardian

SECTION 1. TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section 1. Executive Summary
Section 2. Introduction – Elements of Context
   Sub-Section 1. Overall Philosophy
   Sub-Section 2. Historical Outlook
      Par. 1. Export Control Regimes within the Borders of the Former Soviet Union.
      Par. 2. Legislative Changes in the Russian Federation
   Sub-Section 3. Participation in International Regimes
      Par. 1. Treaties and Regimes Dealing with Specific Items and Technologies
      Par. 2. Treaties Dealing with Specific Areas
Section 3. Control Regime
   Sub-Section 1. Military Goods and Services
      Par. 1. Overall Presentation
      Par. 2. Control Lists

1. Iliya Zotkin is an attorney at law at Hogan & Hartson, LLP, Moscow, Russian Federation. Clémence Bastien and Gregory Mardian graduated from Paris Sud-11 University Law School Master on Space Activities and Telecommunications Law. Clémence Bastien is currently working at the Marketing, Strategy and Global Development Department of EADS, Paris, France. Gregory Mardian is currently Head of the legal department of Metracom, Buc, France.

SECTION 2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

After the collapse of the Soviet Union in the early nineties, the Russian Federation progressively reshaped a comprehensive legal framework for export control. To govern the export of military products, the lower chamber of the Russian Parliament adopted on 3 July 1998 a federal law on ‘Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States’, which sets out the regulatory principles. Only ‘national negotiators’, state-owned or partly state-owned companies which are authorized by the President of the Russian Federation to participate in military-technical cooperation, are entitled to ship military products abroad. Moreover, the export control procedure requires not only authorization for the right to conduct foreign trade activities involving goods of a military nature, but also the licensing of the actual import and export of such products. As for dual-use items, a 1999 law ‘On Export Control’ sets up a system in which the subject of license is not the company but
the export operation. Export control law goes beyond trade in physical goods and addresses foreign economic activity involving intellectual property, and establishes a ‘catch-all’ rule.

SECTION 3. INTRODUCTION – ELEMENTS OF CONTEXT

SUB-SECTION 1. OVERALL PHILOSOPHY

The Russian Federation is an important actor on the export control scene because it holds vast amounts of nuclear materials, weapons of mass destruction (WMD), dual-use technology and related know-how, and extensive stockpiles of weaponry. Export control policy contributes to international stability by establishing cooperation in areas such as reducing threats to global security and the use of WMD. Moreover, Russian export control regulation in particular acts as a barometer to gauge the state of Russia’s relationship with the United States (US).

Russia was also motivated by economic reasons to set up a comprehensive export control regime, since the export control legislation permits a trade regulation rooted in criteria other than tariff policies. The objective is to enable Russian exporters actively to sell goods on foreign markets, while preventing dissemination of the knowledge behind those domestic technologies, which are the source of the country competitiveness. Controls on technologies are seen as particularly sensitive and of a great importance for Russia’s competitiveness.

SUB-SECTION 2. HISTORICAL OUTLOOK

Par. 1. Export Control Regimes within the Borders of the Former Soviet Union

Within the borders of the former Soviet Union, the transfer of military and dual-use goods is a very serious issue because illegal re-exports are known to take place (mainly in Central Asia). For this reason, the US provided export control support to the Russian Federation, Belarus, Kazakhstan and Ukraine (Nunn-Lugar Cooperative Threat Reduction Program). The international community has called for the harmonization of export control procedures in the countries of the former Soviet Union. On 19 April 1999, an agreement between the Russian Federation and Belarus, calling for the development of a single procedure for export controls in both countries, entered into force. Nonetheless, there remains for the moment a significant lack of effective and compatible controls between the Russian Federation and Belarus (and among the Newly Independent States (NIS) in general), mainly because they have different perceptions of what poses a threat to their countries. Many of the NIS still have rudimentary control systems.
Par. 2. Legislative Changes in the Russian Federation

Before 1998, the Russian Federation did not have a comprehensive export control law. The Soviet Union did not feel that it was necessary to control the provision of military or dual-use goods. The legal basis for export control procedures rested on several presidential decrees, government regulation and a law on state regulation of foreign economic activity (1995). At the time, Russian exporters of controlled items were required to obtain two licenses, one from the Federal Service for Currency and Export Control (VEK, under the authority of the Ministry of Defence (MoD)), and another from the Ministry of Trade. Since 3 July 1998 (the date on which the State Duma adopted a comprehensive federal law on ‘Military-Technical Cooperation of the Russian Federation with Foreign States’), the only body competent to deliver a license has operated under the authority of the MoD.

With regard dual-use goods and services, the Russian government issued a ‘catch all’ export control regulation on a 22 January 1998 Decree. Under the decree, Russian firms are forbidden to sell dual-use goods if they know they will be used in WMD, even if the items are not specifically mentioned on ‘control lists’. A comprehensive federal law ‘On export control’ took effect on 29 July 1999. The law provides, in its article 6, that export control lists should be drawn up by the President, in consultation with the Parliament and industry representatives. This represents a significant change from previous regulations, which gave the executive branch sole discretion over the contents of the lists. In this respect, the law provides a new foundation for export control policy, empowering other actors than those from simply the executive branch. Since August 2004, it has been the Federal Technical Export Control Service (FTECS), a successor to the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade (MEDT), operating under the authority of the MoD, which is responsible for issuing licenses.

SUB-SECTION 3. PARTICIPATION IN INTERNATIONAL REGIMES

The following chart displays the Russian Federation’s participation status in export control related international treaties. Information is also given, where relevant, of whether the Russian Federation may have only acceded to a treaty (i.e. when it is not a found ing member of the treaty or has not ratified it).

Where the treaty in question pre-dates 1991, it means that the Russian Federation inherited the status of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR).

2. Lower Chamber of the Russian Parliament.
**Russian Federation**

**Par. 1.** Treaties and Regimes Dealing with Specific Items and Technologies

### Nuclear weapons treaties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treaty name</th>
<th>Overall status</th>
<th>Specific status</th>
<th><strong>Enforceable in the Russian Federation</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Test Ban</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited Test Ban Treaty(^3)</td>
<td>OS: 5 August 1963</td>
<td>S: 5 August 1963</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 10 October 1963</td>
<td>R: 10 October 1963</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive Nuclear Test Ban Treaty(^4)</td>
<td>OS: 24 September 1996</td>
<td>S: 24 September 1996</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: not in force</td>
<td>R: 30 June 2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-proliferation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty(^5)</td>
<td>OS: 1 July 1968</td>
<td>S: 7 January 1970</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 5 March 1970</td>
<td>R: 5 March 1970</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAEA Comprehensive Safeguards Agreement(^6)</td>
<td>EF: 10 June 1985</td>
<td>n./a.(^7)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAEA Model Additional Protocol(^8)</td>
<td>OS: 22 March 2000</td>
<td>n./a.(^9)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: Not yet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OS: Opened for signature; EF: Entry into force; S/R: Signature/Ratification; A: Accession.

### Biological and chemical weapons treaties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treaty name</th>
<th>Overall status</th>
<th>Specific status</th>
<th><strong>Enforceable in the Russian Federation</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geneva Protocol(^10)</td>
<td>OS: 17 June 1925</td>
<td>A: 5 April 1928</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 8 February 1928</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological Convention(^11)</td>
<td>OS: 10 April 1972</td>
<td>S: 10 April 1972</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 26 March 1975</td>
<td>R: 26 March 1975</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Convention(^12)</td>
<td>OS: 13 January 1993</td>
<td>S: 13 January 1993</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 29 April 1997</td>
<td>R: 5 November 1997</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OS: Opened for signature; EF: Entry into force; S/R: Signature/Ratification; A: Accession.

---

### Conventional arms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treaty name</th>
<th>Overall status</th>
<th>Specific status</th>
<th>Enforceable in the Russian Federation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Protocol on Firearms to the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime&lt;sup&gt;13&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>DA: 31 May 2001 EF: 3 July 2005</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on anti-personnel mines&lt;sup&gt;14&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>OS: 18 September 1997 EF: 1st March 1999</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OS: Opened for signature; DA: Date of adoption; EF: Entry into force; S/R: Signature/Ratification; A: Accession.

### Multilateral export control regimes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regime name</th>
<th>Formation</th>
<th>Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zangger Committee&lt;sup&gt;15&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1971</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear Suppliers Group</td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia Group</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>No&lt;sup&gt;16&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missile Technology Control Regime</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wassenaar Arrangement&lt;sup&gt;17&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

4. UNGA, resolution 50/245
6. Agreement Between the Agency and States Required in Connection with the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT), INFCIRC/153 (Corrected).
7. This treaty is a bilateral one and, accordingly, the differences that apply to multilateral treaties (between the overall status and the specific status) do not apply.
8. Model Protocol Additional to the Agreement(s) Between State(s) and the Agency for the Application of Safeguards, INFCIRC/540(Corrected).
9. This treaty is a bilateral one and, accordingly, the differences that apply to multilateral treaties (between the overall status and the specific status) do not apply.
15. Non Proliferation Treaty Exporters Committee (also called the Zangger Committee).
Others

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Adoption</th>
<th>Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UN Register on Conventional Arms&lt;sup&gt;18&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>9 December 1991</td>
<td>Yes&lt;sup&gt;19&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme of Action on Small Arms and Light Weapons&lt;sup&gt;20&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>20 July 2001</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Code of conduct&lt;sup&gt;21&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>25 November 2002</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Par. 2. Treaties Dealing with Specific Areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International zones</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treaty name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moon agreement&lt;sup&gt;26&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OS: Opened for signature; EF: Entry into force; S/R: Signature/Ratification; A: Accession.

16. Russia does not participate in the A.G but complies with the rules.
17. Wassenaar Arrangement on export controls for conventional arms and dual-use goods and technologies.
18. A/RES/46/36/L.
19. Information provided for the calendar years 1992 up to 2005.
23. The Russian Federation succeeded the USSR.
Regional nuclear weapons-free zones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treaty name</th>
<th>Overall status</th>
<th>Specific status</th>
<th>Enforceable in the Russian Federation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treaty of Tlatelolco38</td>
<td>OS: 14 February 1967</td>
<td></td>
<td>No29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 22 April 1967</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty of Rarotonga30</td>
<td>OS: 6 August 1985</td>
<td></td>
<td>No31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 11 December 1986</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty of Bangkok32</td>
<td>OS: 15 December 1995</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: 27 March 1997</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty of Pelindaba33</td>
<td>OS: 11 April 1996</td>
<td></td>
<td>No34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EF: not in force</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OS: Opened for signature; EF: Entry into force; S/R: Signature/Ratification; A: Accession.

On December 1992, the Parliament of the Republic of Tatarstan declared the region a nuclear-weapon-free zone, thereby committing itself to not producing or storing fissionable material or components of WMD.

SECTION 4. CONTROL REGIME

SUB-SECTION 1. MILITARY GOODS AND SERVICES

Par. 1. Overall Presentation

As far as military commodities are concerned, the lower chamber of the Russian Parliament adopted on 3 July 199835 a federal law on ‘Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States’ (MTC) setting the regulatory principles.36 Only ‘national

---

34. The Russian Federation signed the Protocols I and II (S: 5 November 1996).
36. Implemented by the Presidential decree No. 1062 on 10 September 2005.
Russian Federation

negotiators’, authorized by the State, can ship military items abroad. They must obtain a license every time they wish to export or import a specific item or service. This license is granted with reference to two lists: the ‘state list’ (which refers to the country of destination) and the ‘equipment list’ (which refers to the item itself). The Federal Service on Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States (FSMTC) has a prominent role in the implementation of the MTC and is the body which ultimately issues the license.\(^{37}\) According to the FSMTC, Russian arms exports in 2005 reached $6.1 billion, hitting a record high for the past few years.\(^{38}\) According to Defence Minister Sergei Ivanov,\(^{39}\) defence orders will total $9 billion in 2006.

Anybody who breaches Russian law governing the export or import of military items exposes themselves to civil, administrative, and criminal law sanctions.

Sub-Par. 1. Requirements Prior to Any Specific Import/Export (i.e. Manufacturing Phase)

According to the Federal Law on Weapon dated 13 December 1996, No. 150-FZ, development and manufacturing of weapon are subject to licensing by the Federal Industrial Agency and the Federal Space Agency (depending on the type of weapon).

Sub-Par. 2. Requirements at the Import and/or Export Stage

I. Goods

Imports are generally subject to the same regime as exports. Currently, there are no specific provisions as far as imports of military goods are concerned.

The export control of weapons and military equipment, as well as information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity and its exclusive rights, which are for military use, is conducted in accordance with laws of the Russian Federation in the sphere of MTC.\(^{40}\)

The federal law indicates that only ‘national negotiators’ shall participate in the exercise of MTC. ‘National negotiators’ are either specialized federal state unitary enterprises (today Rosoboronexport), which have permanent Presidential authorization to conduct foreign trade activities in the military sphere, or Russian manufacturers of military products that have obtained authorization from the President to exercise foreign trade activity in the military sphere.\(^{41}\)

In the military field, the import/export procedure is at once an authorization and a license-based one. The government has the power to issue any related regulation

---

38. Ria Novosti, 10 February 2006.
41. Please refer to Chapter 10. Section 5. Sub-Section. 2.Par. 2 below for more details on this matter.
it deems necessary. A two-step procedure is in force. Once a national negotiator has obtained authorization from the President to conduct foreign trade activities involving military items, it must obtain a license from the FSMTC, 42 to be able to export or import the items.

Military goods are very seldomly imported.
The Federal Service on Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States (FSMTC), operating under the authority of the Ministry of Defence (MoD), 43 is the authority in charge of delivering licenses, and checking whether the items to be exported are on the control lists (on this point, refer to below). Licenses for export and import on military goods shall be issued by the FSMTC on the basis of the decisions made by the President of the Russian Federation, or the Federal Government, or the FSMTC. A single copy of the license is issued and it cannot be transferred to a third party. It is compulsory for the importer/exporter to be in a position to produce the original copy of the license in order to pass the customs check carried out by the State Customs Committee.

II. Services
Like goods, services related to military activities are subject to export control. Article 1 of the Federal Law ‘Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States’ (MTC) lists what such services are. Among them are:

- Training in the development, production, operation, maintenance, modernization, and servicing of arms and military equipment;
- Training and instruction of military and military-technical personnel of foreign states; and
- Performance and/or participation in the performance of research, testing, development, and engineering in the creation, modernization and/or destruction of military products and means of protecting against WMD and conventional arms.

III. Persons/Deemed Export
The release of certain technologies or products to a foreign national in the Russian Federation is ‘deemed’ to be an export to the home country of the foreign national, and triggers the export control procedures.

---


Par. 2. Control Lists

Equipment list: the list of military products authorized for transfer abroad to foreign entities is drawn up on the basis of recommendations by the Government. However, the President must approve the list.

State list: the list of states to which the transfer of military products is authorized must also be approved by the President. He or she can restrict the number of partners for military-technical cooperation by proscribing those destinations he or she deems unsafe.

The President can thus restrict or expand both the type of weapons transferable to selected countries, and the list of countries to which the listed military products can be transferred.

Par. 3. Licensing and Enforcement Authorities

MTC with other countries is regulated and implemented as described below.

The President of the Russian Federation is in charge of setting content and procedure guidelines in this field. He approves, enlarges or restricts the equipment and state lists, and establishes federal bodies to deal with MTC.

The Government of the Russian Federation implements the presidential guidelines, has the authority to conclude international agreements, and regulates domestic and foreign prices for military products.

Federal executive bodies implement presidential decisions and governmental regulations.

A series of ministries and federal agencies also play a role in the process. They receive a document package from the FSMTC and approve or disapprove the license issuance. Their opinion is final. If their decision is negative, the applicant cannot be granted a license. Before they make their decision, however, the license applicant is entitled to submit further explanatory documents to support the application. During the inter-agency review, the reviewing authorities will take into account the end-users, the technology involved and the item to be exported.

The FSMTC is ultimately in charge of issuing licenses for military goods.

The procedure to import and to export defence goods is summarized in the following flow chart.

Par. 4. Sanctions and Recourses Available to the Importer/Exporter

Anybody who breaches Russian law governing the export or import of military items exposes themselves to civil, administrative, and criminal law sanctions.

44. List No. 1, provided by the Presidential Decree No. 647 on 30 August 2001.
45. List No. 2, provided by the Presidential Decree No. 647 on 30 August 2001.
Sub-Par. 1. Export Control and the Criminal Code

Even before the existence of a consistent Federal Law, in July 1998, President Yeltsin had asked the government to amend the Criminal Code ‘regarding responsibility for the illegal distribution of technology, scientific and technical information, and services related to the manufacture of WMD and delivery missiles’. On 7 May
2002, President Putin signed a Federal law\textsuperscript{46} which amended articles 188 and 189 of the Criminal Code and introduced new sanctions for trafficking and illegal exports of controlled items. Amendments to Article 188 expanded the list of items, the illicit trafficking of which is subject to criminal prosecution, to include radiation sources, fissile materials, and WMD. Article 189 was amended to expand the list of activities considered a crime under the Criminal Code and now includes any transaction that may contribute to the development of WMD. Since 8 January 2003, article 188.2 of the Criminal Code states that any party found guilty can be imprisoned for the term from three to seven years and additionally fined up to one million Russian roubles (approximately 28 000 Euros), or the amount of their entire income for the past five years. The sanctions take the form of a fine and/or a prison sentence (of up to 10 years). Criminal penalties have only been imposed twice in Russia.

Commenting on the amendments, analysts\textsuperscript{47} have noted that they weaken the strength of the export control legislation to an extent. Article 189 limits responsibility for wrongdoing solely to the exporter. The use of intermediaries could allow wrongdoers to circumvent the law altogether.

Sub-Par. 2. Export Control and Administrative Penalties

The new Administrative Code of the Russian Federation entered into force in July 2002. Its article 14.20 outlines penalties for violations of export control procedures. It states that transfers of goods, information or services, which can be used to develop WMD, without a license (where licensing is required), in violation of the terms of a license, or with an illegally obtained license, are subject to penalties equal to the value of the goods, the information, and/or the services concerned with the illegal transaction, as well as the confiscation of such goods and assets. A violation of the established accounting procedures for foreign transactions will result in penalties of 10–20 times the minimum wage\textsuperscript{48} for officials and 100–200 times the minimum wage for corporations.

Sub-Section 2. Dual-Use Goods and Services

Par. 1. Overall Presentation

Federal Law No. 183-F3 ‘On export control’ (18 July 1999)\textsuperscript{49} sets out Russia’s dual-use export control policy, the competencies state bodies are vested with, and the

\begin{itemize}
\item[46.] Adopted by the State Duma on 5 April 2002, approved by the Federation Council on 23 April 2002, and signed by Russian President Putin on 7 May 2002.
\item[47.] From the Russian non-governmental organization Center for the Development of Democracy and Human Rights.
\item[48.] In this context, the ‘minimum wage’ is a statutory set amount used for calculation purposes. It does not reflect economic reality and is set out specifically for the purpose of calculation of the taxes, levies and fees. Presently, the ‘minimum wage’ for the purpose of calculation amounts to 100 Russian Rubles.
\end{itemize}
rights, obligations and responsibilities of those wishing to carry out dual-use export activities. The law extended the scope of the control regime so that now not only is trade in physical goods subject to control, but also foreign economic activity which involves an exchange of intellectual property. The law also established a ‘catch-all’ rule. If a product must be submitted to export control, a state assessment takes place to determine whether to issue a license or not.\textsuperscript{50} The state assessment is conducted by the Federal Technical Export Control Service (FTECS)\textsuperscript{51} of the MoD, which is also the authority which will ultimately issue the license.

\textit{Sub-Par. 1. Requirements Prior to Any Specific Import/Export (i.e. Manufacturing Phase)}

Dual-use goods and services are referred to in the Federal Law ‘On export control’ as follows:

- crude resources, materials, equipment, scientific and technical information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity that could, by virtue of their distinctive features and properties contribute substantially to the development of WMD, their delivery systems, and other types of weapons and military equipment.

Article 19 of the Federal Law ‘On export control’ states that general licenses for the export of any dual-use commodities to a given country will only be issued to legal entities with accredited Internal Compliance Programmes (ICP). These programmes are supposed to speed up the license-delivering process.

No general license will be delivered to an exporter which has not implemented an accredited ICP. An exporter without an accredited ICP is required to obtain a special license, which covers only one given product and destination.

\textit{Sub-Par. 2. Requirements at the Import and/or Export Stage}

\textbf{I. Goods}

In order to determine whether dual-use goods or technology are subject to export control (and therefore whether an import/export license is needed), it is necessary to obtain an independent classification of the item.\textsuperscript{52} This classification stage is compulsory.\textsuperscript{53} The item may be classified through the exporter’s ICP\textsuperscript{54} or by

\textsuperscript{50} Article 21 of the law ‘On export control’. see \textit{supra} note 609.
\textsuperscript{51} Decrees of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1085, August 16, 2004.
\textsuperscript{52} The assessment procedure is ruled by governmental Decree No. 477, 21 June 2001, modified by governmental Decree No. 731, 3 October 2002, and then by governmental Decree No. 54, 4 February 2005 <www.fstec.ru/_ekcon/_ddoc/doc/doc_1_4_108.htm>.
\textsuperscript{53} Article 24 of the law ‘On export control’, see \textit{supra} note 609.
\textsuperscript{54} In December 2002, the MEDT delivered accreditation to enterprises which established internal compliance programmes. This accreditation gives them the opportunity to obtain general licenses, which permit the export of specified items to particular end-users for a fixed period, without the need for additional governmental approvals. All other actors must obtain individual licenses for each individual export.
contracting with an organization authorized to grant official classifications. For the purpose of the classification assessment, the exporter must provide a series of documents, which include evidence of the proposed end-use and guarantees that the exporter will abide by intellectual property rules, and the State’s policy on official secrets.

If the independent classification reveals that the product is subject to export control, the FTECS of the MoD will carry out an investigation into the license application. It will review, within 20 days, all the documents submitted by the exporter. The documents the exporter must submit include the elements below.

- A letter of request from the exporter asking for an export license. In the letter, the exporter must undertake to send to the FTECS, within a maximum of ten days after the expiry of the license, a copy of the license signed by Customs, as evidence that the license was effectively used by the exporter.
- An official application form, duly completed.
- A copy of the export/import contract. The contract must specify the end-user, the purpose of the export/import, and the country in which the end-use will take place.
- A copy of the agreement between the importer and the exporter, if the person asking for a license is an intermediary.
- Various supporting documents about the person asking for a license.

Article 20 of the Federal Law ‘On export control’ is a ‘catch-all’ clause. Russian exporters are required to renounce contacts with foreign parties, ‘if they have valid reasons to believe that the goods, information, work, service and the results of intellectual activity will be used by a foreign party for the development of WMD and their delivery systems’. Russian authorities understand this provision to mean that exporters should ensure that their foreign partners will use the technology acquired for civil purposes only.

After reviewing the documents, the FTECS decides whether or not to issue the license. The initial license period cannot exceed twelve months but the national negotiator can apply for extensions. The export licenses delivered are of two types: general licenses and one-off licenses.

For import activities, if the item is intended to remain permanently under Russian jurisdiction, an import license is always required. If the entry is temporary, an import license is needed if the product is imported by a foreign company. For a temporary import by a Russian company, only an import authorization is needed.

According to the regulations on adjustment of licensing fee for import/export of military goods, the licensing fee amount to 1000 Russian Rubbles (approximately 29 €). The regulation also lists a number of cases when the fee is not

---

57. Regulation on adjustment of licencing fee for the import/ export of military goods, approved by Order No. 16 of FSMTC date February 23, 2001.
payable (amount of contract less than 15 000$; import paid from the Federal budget; temporary import for exhibitions, etc.).

Controlled goods are always subject to customs clearance and inspection, which customs officials initiate after the national negotiator has shown them the original copy of the license.

According to the Federal law ‘On Export Control’, the decision whether to issue the licenses has to intervene before 45 days from the date of receipt of license application material (these 45 days include the 20 days above-mentioned and dedicated to the independent classification). However, the period of time can be shorter or can take up to three months, depending on whether the exporter is new to the process, the end-user is known, or the file is complete. Industrials report that over the past few years, there has been no significant improvement in shortening the time of the licensing process.

II. Services, Tangible and Intangible Data

Like goods, services and tangible and intangible data are subject to export control. No specific license is required for services.

As far as military services are concerned, export control is defined as the procedures established to enable foreign economic activity with goods, information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity that could be used in the development of WMD, their delivery systems, and other types of weapons and military equipment.

Russian authorities pay particular attention to technology transfers. ‘Technology’ is defined as any information necessary to the production, elaboration or use of any military product. A technology transfer can take the form of a ‘data transfer’, but it can also take the form of any ‘technical help’. The following are considered to be ‘data’: technical drawings, diagrams, printed copies, models, formulae, charts, technical specifications and instructions (either on paper or in any other means). The following is considered to be ‘technical help’: staff training, education, exchange of production knowledge and consulting services.

The control of intangible technology is complicated because the means of conveying it are difficult to identify and control (software medium, specific context of the transfer...). The Russian Federation has attempted as far as possible to subject to control as wide a range as possible of intangible technology transfers: for example, exchange of data through any form of visual contact (at scientific conferences, meetings, talks, scientific exchanges, lectures, consultations, demonstrations, the education of foreign students, etc.), and any form of electronic/electric transmission (fax, telephone, e-mails) requires a license (the same license as for military goods transfers).

However, elements dealing with fundamental scientific research are not included in the scope of export control. This creates the difficulty of having to

---

58. 45 days is a general term that may be changed by the underlying legislation.
59. Article 1 of the Federal Law on Export Control, see supra note 609.
distinguish between fundamental science and applicable science, and the boundary between the two is sometimes blurred and constantly moving.

III. Persons/Deemed Export
The release of certain technologies or products to a foreign national in the Russian Federation is ‘deemed’ to be an export to the home country of the foreign national, and triggers the export control procedures. The 1999 law ‘On export control’ deals not only with the supply of goods and technology to foreign countries, but also with their transfer to foreigners on the territory of the Russian Federation.

In addition to the concept of ‘deemed export’, the Russian Federation law does not require a license from the FTECS for the temporary export of goods to a Russian person (body or entity) outside of the territory of the Russian Federation, but only an authorization from the Export Control Commission (ECC).

Par. 2. Control Lists
The President, at the Government’s request, approves the lists of controlled goods and technologies by issuing an edict. Currently, ‘special’ (as opposed to ‘general’) licenses are required if the item falls within one of the five lists below.

- List of the dual-use goods and products which can be used for the manufacturing of armaments and military hardware.
- List of equipments, materials and technologies used in developing missile weapons.
- List of pathogens, fragments of their genetic materials, genetically altered pathogens, and equipment with potential for use in developing bacteriological weapons.
- List of chemical equipment and technologies with potential use in the development of chemical weapons.
- List of the dual-use equipment, materials and technologies which can be used for nuclear purposes.

---


Par. 3. Licensing and Enforcement Authorities

The different missions of governmental entities in the sphere of export control are defined in article 8 of the Federal law ‘On Export Control’.

The President defines basic policy guidelines, ensures coordination between the various governmental agencies involved in the process of export control and approves the lists of controlled goods.

The Government implements export control policy (including compliance with international regimes) and determines procedures for conducting foreign trade in controlled items.

The FTECS under the authority of the MoD plays a prominent role; it issues licenses for the export of dual-use and critical nuclear materials. The FTECS has seven regional branches across the territory of the Russian Federation.

The Export Control Commission coordinates policy, implements legislation and settles disputes between different administrative bodies.

A series of ministries and federal agencies intervene in the license-delivering process: they receive the document package from the FTECS and approve/disapprove the license issuance. Their opinion is mandatory. In the event of a negative decision, the applicant will not be granted a license. The applicant has, at this stage of the process, the opportunity to support its case by submitting explanatory documents. When deciding whether the license should be granted, the bodies involved in the inter-agency review take into account several criteria. They consider the end-user, the technology and the item to be exported.

Par. 4. Sanctions and Recourses Available to the Importer/Exporter

Chapter VI of the Federal law ‘On export control’ describes the sanctions which can be applied in the event of the following violations:

The performance, without a license or permit, of foreign economic operations involving goods, information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity which are subject to export control in accordance with articles 6 and 20 of this Federal Law.

The submission of forged documents, or documents containing false information, to obtain a license or permit for foreign economic operations with goods, information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity subject to export control in accordance with articles 6 and 20 of such Federal Law.

---

66. Decrees of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1085, August 16, 2004. Until the FTECS becomes fully established, the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade Department of Export Control continues to deal with the licensing process.
67. For the locations, addresses and phone number, see <www.fstec.ru/_ekcon/_spisterr.htm>.
68. See supra note 609.
The violation of the requirements and terms of licenses or permits for foreign economic operations with goods, information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity subject to export control in accordance with articles 6 and 20 of such Federal Law;

Non-compliance or improper compliance with the instructions of the special authorized federal agency of the executive branch in the sphere of export control;

The creation of obstacles to keep the officials of federal agencies from the executive branch, exercising powers in the sphere of export control, from performing their duties;

The unwarranted refusal to furnish information, which has been requested by federal agencies of the legislative and executive branches for the purposes of export control, or the deliberate distortion or concealment of this information;

The violation of the established procedure for keeping records of foreign economic transactions with goods, information, work, services, and the results of intellectual activity, for the purposes of export control.

Officials of organizations and citizens who are guilty of violating the law of the Russian Federation in respect of export control of controlled goods and services will be subject to criminal, administrative, and civil legal penalties. 70 An organization violating the law can be deprived of the right to exercise some foreign economic/trade activities, for a maximum duration of three years.71 The possibility of recourse exists in the event the above-mentioned sanctions are applied.72

The procedure to import and to export dual-use goods is summarized in the following flow chart.

SECTION 5. SPECIFICITIES/SPACE-RELATED PROVISIONS

SUB-SECTION 1. SPECIFICITIES OF THE CONTROL REGIME

Par. 1. Military Goods and Services

Only certain specific persons (known as ‘subjects of military-technical cooperation’) have the right to ship military products abroad.

Sub-Par. 1. Government Intermediary

A 1997 Presidential decree sets out the actors in charge of controlling the export and import of military goods. Rosoboronexport State Corporation, which was founded by a presidential order, replaced a collection of State intermediaries (‘Rosvooroujenie’, ‘Promexport’, ‘Rossiskie Tekhnologii’), and became the sole arms trade

---

70. Article 31 of the Federal Law ‘On export control’.
intermediary state agency. It results from the merger in 2000 of two Federal State Unitary Enterprises (Rosvoorouzhenie and Promexport). It operates in more than sixty countries, and is controlled by the MoD. Rosoboronexport accounts for 90 per cent of the Russian Federation’s military exports. It is officially involved in the export/import operations for military goods only. It is also entitled to deal with
dual-use products, but it has no enforcement powers. The remaining 10 per cent of Russian military exports is conducted by developers and manufacturers of weapons and military products.

Sub-Par. 2. Developers and Manufacturers of Weapons and Military Products

Developers and manufacturers of weapons and military products have the right to conduct foreign trade activities, on condition that the federal Government owns at least 51 per cent of the company shares and that the rest of the shares belong to Russian persons (entities and/or individuals). Russian individuals are not allowed to conduct MTC.

At the end of the Nineties, about fifteen firms were given the right to get involved in foreign trade, and to sell their products abroad directly. Such companies include Antei (missiles, Moscow), Arsenyev Company (military helicopters, Arsenyev, Primorsky krai), Gidromash (plane mechanics, Nizhni Novgorod), Murom (armored vehicle and tanks, Murom, Vladimirskaya oblast, Rubin (submarines, St Petersburg) and Metrovagonmash (air defence, Moscow).

Par. 2. Dual-Use Goods and Services

Exports of controlled goods that do not involve a transfer to a foreign party (particularly if the goods are intended for display in exhibits or for personal use), do not require a license, but only require an authorization. The only conditions are that the goods remain under the direct control of the Russian party taking them out of the Russian Federation, and that they are returned in due time.

Par. 3. Intellectual Property and Patent Rights

Sub-Par. 1. FAPRID and the Licensing Process

In May 1998, a decree,\textsuperscript{73} and then a government resolution\textsuperscript{74} established that intellectual property rights related to military, nuclear, and dual-use technologies that are developed with the help of State funding belong to the State. The Ministry of Justice is in charge of dealing with the government’s interest in this field, through its intermediary agency the Federal Agency for the Legal Protection of the Results of Intellectual Activity in the Sphere of Military, Special, and Dual-Use Technology (FAPRID).

The FAPRID has a consultative role in the license attribution process: it approves the export and submits its approval to the license-delivering authority.

\textsuperscript{73} 14 May, 1998, President Yeltsin’s Decree: On the Legal Protection of the Results of Scientific, Experimental, and Technological Work with Military, Special, and Dual-Use Applications.

\textsuperscript{74} Resolution No. 1132 on 29 September 1998, implementing the directives issued by President Yeltsin in Presidential Decree No. 556 of 14 May 1998.
Further, it has a monopoly over the right to register intellectual property rights and gather ‘royalties’ from the exporters on behalf of the state.

**Sub-Par. 2. Patent Regulation**

In 1999, FAPRID investigated cases\(^\text{75}\) in which Russian citizens had illegally patented Russian technology with potential applications in the military field. Official representatives said those who had filed the patents in the US could be charged with violating Article 189 of the Russian Criminal Code (which prohibits the illegal export of technologies used in the production of WMD).

**Par. 4. Means of Submitting License Applications**

There are currently no electronic licensing procedures. Most of the time, the exporters must physically carry license applications and other documents to Moscow in order to obtain the required signature.

**Par. 5. Re-exports and Temporary Exports**

The Russian government established procedures for the temporary export or the re-export of controlled items. Re-exports are covered under the same rules as exports. However, it is unsure whether these procedures are implemented in practice.

**Par. 6. Effectiveness of the Implementation of the Russian Export Control Rules**

The Russian Federation has made great progress in improving its system of laws and regulations in respect of the licensing and controlling of its sensitive exports. Nonetheless, it faces major problems in implementing its system of controls.\(^\text{76}\) Implementation could be improved if the actors involved were aided in understanding the system. Thinking along these lines, the Russian government established\(^\text{77}\) eight regional Classification Centres, in order to assist exporters and customs officials in determining whether items are subject to licensing. Until now, only the Russian Academy of Science (Moscow) and the Centre for Industry Development Projects (Saint Petersburg) have an expertise covering the full range of controlled goods.

\(^{75}\) Yuriy Gaydukov, general director of the F.A.P.R.I.D., told a 3 June 1999 press conference, Vremya-MN newspaper reported.

\(^{76}\) ‘Nuclear Non-Proliferation Concerns and Export Controls in Russia, Testimony before the Governmental Affairs Subcommittee on International Security, Proliferation, and Federal Services’, by David Albright, President, Institute for Science and International Security (I.S.I.S.), 6 June 2002.

\(^{77}\) In accordance with Government Decree No. 477, 21 June 2001.
Sub-Section 2. Space-Related Provisions in the Control Regime

Par. 1. Roles of the Licensing and Enforcement Authorities

As far as export control is concerned, the Federal Space Agency cooperates closely with the FSMTC, the license-delivering authority for military products.

The MoD certifies space technologies intended for use in a military context. The aim of this certification is to check that space technologies match the requirements of federal laws.

Par. 2. Details of the Regime Relating to Space Activities

In the Russian Federation, space activities are subject to a special license, which is issued only once an investigation has been carried out. This investigation is specific to the context of space technologies and is different to the investigation carried out for the export control of other products. It aims, among other things, at establishing whether the item is subject to control or not.

No separate department has been specifically created in the Russian Space Agency (Roskosmos) to deal with export control issues. The department that deals with international cooperation also covers export control matters.

SECTION 6. LIST OF ACRONYMS

ATS Australian Treaty Series
AG Australia Group
BTWC Biological and Toxic Weapons Convention
COCOM Coordinating Committee for multilateral strategic export control
CTBT Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty
CWC Chemical Weapons Convention
ECC Export Control Commission
FAPRID Federal Agency for the Legal Protection of the Results of Intellectual Activity in the Sphere of Military, Special, and Dual-Use Technology
FSMTC Federal Service on Military Technical Cooperation with Foreign States.
FTECS Federal Technical Export Control Service
IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
ICP Internal Compliance Programme
ILM International Legal Material
MEDT Ministry of Economic Development and Trade
MoD Ministry of Defence
MTC Military-Technical Cooperation
MTCR Missile Technology Control Regime
SECTION 7. REFERENCES

I. Primary Documentation

1. Statutory Legislation


2. Regulations


Presidential Decree No. 1085, 16 August, 2004, creating the FTECS


Resolution No. 1132, 29 September 1998, implementing the directives issued by Presidential Decree, No. 556, 14 May 1998


---

For an exhaustive and up dated list of all the norms (directly or indirectly related to export control) in force, see (in Russian) <fstec.ru/_excon/_zakons.htm>. The full text of all the norms can be found (in Russian) through this page.
II. **Secondary Documentation**

1. **Internet Sites**

   a) **Official Authorities**

   - [www.fstec.ru]: Federal Technical and Export Control Service
   - [www.fsvts.gov.ru]: Federal Service on Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States
   - [www.mil.ru]: the MoD
   - [www.fsb.ru]: Federal Security Service
   - [www.gov.ru]: the best governmental site to get in touch with any official authority
   - [www.rusarm.ru/p_frame/main.htm]: Rosoboronexport
   - [www.roscosmos.ru]: National Space Agency
   - [www.mid.ru]: Ministry of Foreign affairs

   b) **Other Internet Sites**

   - [www.fstec.ru/_ekcon/_zakons.htm]: for any reference to any legal text
   - [www.expcon.ru]: TsPEK (Centre on export control issues)
   - [mdb.cast.ru/mdb/3–2001/ec/1frael/]: for military goods regime
   - [www.sipri.org/contents/expcon/russia.html]: Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI)
   - [projects.sipri.se/expcon/natexpcon/Russia/russia.htm]: Stockholm International Peace Research Institute, general presentation of Russian export control
   - [www.nti.org/db/nisprofs/russia/fulltext/excon/exconlaw.htm]: Federal law on export control, in English
   - [www.nti.org/db/nisprofs/russia/excon/overviw.htm]: Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI)
   - [www.nti.org/db/nisprofs/russia/excon/laws.htm#290799]: Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI)
   - [www.pircenter.org/gpconference/data/aleksedenko.pdf]: (flow chart of a Russian researcher). The PirCenter is a Russian think tank dealing with security matters
   - [www.uga.edu/cits/database/xcdb.htm]: Center for International Trade and Security (CITS), School of public and international affairs, University of Georgia
   - [www.uga.edu/cits/programs/national_evaluations]: CITS.

2. **Paper Publications**


Elena Kiritchenko, Director of the Research Center on North-American studies (IMEMO), Speech at the Moscow Physico-Technical Institute, April 21, 2005. Online in Russian at: <www.armscontrol.ru/course/lectures05a/evk050421.htm>


NIS Export Control Observer, August 2004: <cns.miis.edu/pubs/nisexcon/pdfs/ob_0408e.pdf>

SECTION 8. USEFUL INFORMATION

I. Licensing and Enforcement Authorities Contact Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Директор Федеральной службы по военно-техническому сотрудничеству</th>
<th>Федеральный орган по военно-техническому сотрудничеству</th>
<th>Federal Service on Military-Technical Cooperation with Foreign States, F.S.M.T.C.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Дмитриев М.А.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Address: 115324, Москва, Овчинниковская наб., д.18/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Адрес: 115324, Москва, Овчинниковская наб., д.18/1</td>
<td>Телефон: +7 (095) 696-88-00</td>
<td>Telephone: +7 (095) 696-88-00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>101000, Москва, ул.Кузнецкий мост, дом 22</td>
<td>Телефон: +7 (095) 924-31-58</td>
<td>Telephone: +7 (095) 924-31-58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ТЕРИТОРИАЛЬНЫЕ УПРАВЛЕНИЯ ФСТЭК РОССИИ</th>
<th>FTECS (ФСТЭК) Regional Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ЦЕНТРАЛЬНЫЙ</td>
<td>For the Central Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>117342 г. Москва, Севастопольский пр-т., д. 56/40, стр.1</td>
<td>117342, Moscow, Sevastopolski Prospekt, д. 56/40, стр.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Телефон: +7 (095) 333-50-37</td>
<td>Telephone: +7 (095) 333-50-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Факс: +7 (095) 334-16-21</td>
<td>Fax: +7 (095) 334-16-21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>СЕВЕРО-ЗАПАДНЫЙ</th>
<th>For the North-West Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>190000, г. Санкт-Петербург, Исакиевская пл., д.11</td>
<td>190000, Saint Petersburg, Isaakievskaja Plochad, д.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Телефон: +7 (812) 312-28-14</td>
<td>Telephone: +7 (812) 312-28-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Факс: +7 (812) 312-55-29</td>
<td>Fax: +7 (812) 312-55-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Область</td>
<td>Адрес</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Южный</td>
<td>344012, г. Ростов-на-Дону, ул. Юмпцева, д.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Волго-Вятский</td>
<td>603104, г. Нижний Новгород, пр-т. Гагарина, д.60, к. 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Уральский</td>
<td>620078, г. Екатеринбург, ул. Гагарина, д.286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Сибирский</td>
<td>630017, г. Новосибирск, Военный городок 1, к. 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Дальневосточный</td>
<td>680030 г. Хабаровск, ул. Ленина, д. 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For the South Region 344012, Rostov upon Don, Ioufimtseva Oulitsa, d.4
Telephone: +7 (863-2) 63-67-51
Fax: +7 (863-2) 32-32-93

For the Volga Region 603104, Nizhni-Novgorod, Prospekt Gagarina, d.60, k. 11
Telephone: +7 (8312) 39-62-11
Fax: +7 (8312) 39-68-79

For the Urals Region 620078, Ekaterinburg, Gagarina Oulitsa, d.286
Telephone: +7 (343) 372-18-61
Fax: +7 (343) 372-18-51

For the Siberian Region 630017, Novossibirsk, Voenni Gorodok 1, k. 16
Telephone: +7 (383-2) 27-38-44
Fax: +7 (383-2) 27-39-11

For the Far East Region 680030, Khabarovsky, Lenina Oulitsa, d. 37
Telephone: +7 (4212) 420-755
Fax: +7 (4212) 304-524